

Authorship within the *Synopsis Avium*: a correction

Edward C. Dickinson & Martin Schneider

COPYRIGHT: © 2020 Dickinson and Schneider. This is an article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Licence, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

ABSTRACT: The *Synopsis Avium* published by d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye (correctly not by Lafresnaye & d'Orbigny) was discussed by Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a, b) as if all the new names that had not already been published must to be attributed to both authors. This was a mistake: several names are attributable to d'Orbigny alone based on Art. 50.1. The names requiring correction are *Agleactis pamela* – No. 179 in Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a), *Oreotrochilus estella* – No. 182 in Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a) and *Oreotrochilus adela* – No. 183 in Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a).

KEYWORDS: Alcide d'Orbigny, Baron de Lafresnaye, Trochilidae, authorship, Article 50.1, ICZN Code.

The *Synopsis Avium*, inserted in the *Magasin de Zoologie* volumes for 1837 and 1838, actually appeared in four parts over the period from about February 1837 to June 1839 (see Dickinson & Lebossé, 2018a: 53). Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a: 58) reported that livraisons 1 to 19 of the *Voyage* all appeared before 1837 and that the first 22 appeared before the first part of the *Synopsis*. During that period livraisons 23 to 38 of d'Orbigny's *Voyage dans l'Amérique Méridionale* were being issued. Both works report on d'Orbigny's avifaunal discoveries and both are incomplete.

Almost all the text for the *Synopsis* reached Guérin-Méneville, the editor of the *Magasin de Zoologie* in 1836. Finalising the 1836 volume, Guérin-Méneville (1836)¹ advised that the 1837 volume would include "Le *Synopsis* de tous les Oiseaux recueillis par M. A. d'Orbigny dans son voyage en Amérique; ce Mémoire, qui formera près de 100 pages, est presque terminé."

There is little or no evidence that the manuscript was edited after submission. By the close of 1836 plates 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 6 bis, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 20 and 23 had been published. However, in their text d'Orbigny and Lafresnaye refer to plates 1 to 5 (all published by February 1836) and "6" which might refer to 6 bis which appeared that month along with pl. 23; of pl. 7 published a month earlier there is no mention. All these mentions of plates are to be found in the first 14 pages.

The two authors were well aware that these two publications – the *Synopsis* by them and the *Voyage* by d'Orbigny alone – were proceeding in parallel but they seem not to have tried to correct the manuscript to make clear which names had already been published (in plate captions) by d'Orbigny. This may have been because they considered that new names introduced in plate captions were not available because there was no written description.

¹ Very probably published after the year end, but chronologically it helps to use 1836 here.

This view may have been generally held; Sherborn (1902: vii) wrote: "In the case of plates appearing before the text, the date of each is given if ascertainable (e.g. Schreber's 'Säugethiere'), but in no case is the date of a plate accepted in preference to the date of text ...".

In the *Synopsis* the authors use the term 'Nob.' [= Nobis or 'of us'] in respect of birds they believed they were naming for the first time; but, and this is typical of works of the period, in particular French ones, they also used 'Nob.' when, by combining a previously used specific epithet with a genus-group name not originally used and now used by them for the first time, they claimed a new combination. There are many of these – their identification is simple because they refer to the prior name – on which they are based – and to their author.

The Code (ICZN, 1999) deals with concerns about the identity of authors in Art. 50.1. This article must be interpreted with care. It states that the author of a name of a nomenclatural act is the first person to publish it. Where there are two authors of a work both are publishers; however, names and nomenclatural acts can be judged differently. The name may have a single author such that you can have "Johnson in Johnson and Thomson" as the complete expression of authorship. This requires evidence within the work identifying that role.

That evidence comes in the 1838 volume of the *Magasin de Zoologie* (Huitième année), where "D'Orb." appears in place of "Nob." In three places (p. 29 for *O. Pamela*: p. 32 for *T. Estella*, and p. 33 for *T. Adela*).

Dickinson & Lebossé (2018a) did not realise the significance of this. It has, however, been correctly picked up and debated on BirdForum.² Nothing published on BirdForum is published in the meaning of the Code – content is neither printed nor part of any e-publication that might qualify, so a published correction is needed. On being advised of this by Martin Schneider, Edward Dickinson, satisfied that a correction was necessary, asked Martin to join him to co-author this paper. Two other potential authors were copied in that invitation, but over a four week period neither took up the suggestion that they might choose to participate.

The corrections necessary are as follows:

Agleactis pamela (d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye, 1839) (No. 179 in Dickinson & Lebossé, 2018a: 193): change to *Agleactis pamela* (d'Orbigny, 1839)³

Oreotrochilus estella (d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye, 1839) (No. 182 in Dickinson & Lebossé, 2018a: 195): change to *Oreotrochilus estella* (d'Orbigny, 1839)⁴

Oreotrochilus adela (d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye, 1839) (No. 183 in Dickinson & Lebossé, 2018a: 195): change to *Oreotrochilus adela* (d'Orbigny, 1839).⁵

² <https://www.birdforum.net/showthread.php?t=383253> (accessed 09/11/2019).

³ Alcide d'Orbigny's wife was called Pamela.

⁴ Estella was the name of d'Orbigny's sister.

⁵ Adela is thought to refer to Adelaide, d'Orbigny's mother-in-law.

In Dickinson & Lebossé (2018b: 285) the names of both authors were inferred by the initials used in the 'Authors' column in Table I. so there "d'O & L" must be changed to "d'O".

In each case we could have referred to "d'Orbigny in d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye" but we prefer the simpler alternative; however, by making this comment here we draw attention to that option for those who might be keen to use it.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks go to Mark Brown and Laurent Raty for their comments on BirdForum. We are most grateful to our referees Michel Louette and Svetlana Nikolaeva: Svetlana kindly and gently pointed out the relationships of the names to family members.⁶

REFERENCES

Dickinson, E.C. & A. Lebossé, 2018a A study of d'Orbigny's "*Voyage dans l'Amérique méridionale*". IV. New avian names deriving from d'Orbigny's expedition with evidence for their first introduction and necessary corrections to authorship, dates and citations. – *Zoological Bibliography*, 5 (4): 49-274.

Dickinson, E.C. & A. Lebossé, 2018b. A study of d'Orbigny's "*Voyage dans l'Amérique Méridionale*." V. Necessary corrections to data from the *Index Animalium*. – *Zoological Bibliography*, 5 (5): 275-291.

D'Orbigny, A. & F. de Lafresnaye, 1837. Synopsis Avium ab Alcide d'Orbigny, in ejus per Americam meridionalem itinere, collectarum et ab ipso viatore necnon. Part 1a. – *Magasin de Zoologie*.

D'Orbigny, A. & F. de Lafresnaye, 1838. Synopsis Avium ab Alcide d'Orbigny, in ejus per Americam meridionalem itinere, collectarum et ab ipso viatore necnon. Part 1b. – *Magasin de Zoologie*.

D'Orbigny, A. & F. de Lafresnaye, 1838 [= 1839]. Synopsis Avium ab Alcide d'Orbigny, in ejus per Americam meridionalem itinere, collectarum et ab ipso viatore necnon. Part 2. – *Magasin de Zoologie*

Guérin-Méneville, F.-E., 1836. Sur l'année 1836. Preface pp. v-vi in *Magasin de Zoologie*, 1836.

ICZN (International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature), 1999. *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature*. Fourth Edition, i-xxix, 1-306. – The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London.

Sherborn, C.D., 1902. *Index Animalium sive index nominum quae ab A.D. MDCCCLVIII generibus et speciebus animalium imposita sunt. Sectio prima a kalendi ianuaris, MDCCCLVIII usque ad finem Decembris. MDCCC. i-lix, 1-1195*. – Cambridge.

Addresses: Edward C. Dickinson, Flat 19, Marlborough Court, Southfields Road, Eastbourne, BN21 1BT.
E-mail: edward@asiaorn.org. Martin Schneider, Ludwigshafenerstr. 6B, 86157 Augsburg, Germany.
E-mail: earwig@gmx.net.

⁶ <https://gw.geneanet.org/pyl?lang=en&p=alcide+charles+victor&n=dessalines+d+orbigny> and <https://gw.geneanet.org/lx75?lang=en&p=charles+marie&n=d+orbigny> (accessed 30/01/2020).